

GOVERNANCE OF INNOVATION POLICY

SERDAR TÜRKELİ

100

UNU  
MERIT  
2016



**GOVERNANCE OF INNOVATION POLICY**  
EMPIRICAL STUDIES ON APPLIED POLITICAL ECONOMY  
BY MULTI-METHOD ANALYSIS

SERDAR TÜRKELİ



# **GOVERNANCE OF INNOVATION POLICY**

Empirical Studies on Applied Political Economy  
by Multi-method Analysis

Serdar Türkeli

ISBN 978 90 8666 398.9

Copyright © Serdar Türkeli, 2016

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form, or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission in writing, from the author.

Cover Image (Caption and Credit Information): Claude Monet (French, 1840-1926). Houses of Parliament, Sunlight Effect (Le Parlement, effet de soleil), 1903 Oil on canvas, 32 x 36 1/4 in. (81.3 x 92.1 cm) Brooklyn Museum, Credit Line: Bequest of Grace Underwood Barton, 68.48.1 Image: overall, 68.48.1\_colorcorrected\_SL1.jpg. Brooklyn Museum photograph, non-commercial use granted by Brooklyn Museum. 11/07/2015

Publisher: Boekenplan, Maastricht

Governance of Innovation Policy:  
Empirical Studies on Applied Political Economy  
by Multi-method Analysis

DISSERTATION

to obtain the degree of Doctor at  
Maastricht University,  
on the authority of Rector Magnificus, Prof. dr. L.L.G. Soete,  
in accordance with the decision of the Board of Deans,  
to be defended in public on Wednesday, 3 February 2016, at 14:00 hours

by

Serdar Türkeli

**Promoter**

Prof. Dr. René Kemp

**Assessment Committee**

Prof. Dr. Bart Verspagen (Chair)

Prof. Dr. Susana Borrás (Copenhagen Business School, Denmark)

Dr. Rainer Quitzow (Free University of Berlin, Germany)

Prof. Dr. Luc Soete

Financial support for this dissertation has been provided by UNU-MERIT.

# Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my mother, a primary school teacher, Sebahat Türkeli, and my father, a medical doctor paediatrician, Dr. İsfendiyar Türkeli for providing me not only the existential opening but also the essential follow-up throughout my life so far. Their professions provided me with the tangible and intangible benefits of a healthy body and mind from a very early age. The idea of being born from a marriage of love always inspired me and nurtured my interests, accordingly. My sister, a medical doctor, genetics specialist, Dr. Özlem Türkeli also played a harmonising role by being beyond just a benchmark, a behavioural and a cognitive frontier.

I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Luc Soete; the book he wrote with Chris Freeman, *The Economics of Industrial Innovation*, changed the last decade of my life and will probably continue to do so in the future. The updated discussion on science and technology policy it provides broadened my view during my Master's studies in international engineering and technology management at the University of Duisburg-Essen, Germany. Back then, before reading the book, I was relying on the limited understanding that *"the agents that drive innovation and the economy are large companies which have the capital to invest in research and development of new products and services and to deliver them to customers cheaper, thus raising their standard of living"* (Schumpeter Mark II). Even before that, I had felt as a stand-alone engineer with entrepreneurial ambitions led by Schumpeter's Mark I: *"The innovation and technological change of a nation come from the entrepreneurs or wild spirits doing new things or doing things that are already being done but in a new way."* Simply put, Soete's book shed light on the fact that there were broader dynamics and showed me the path that I wanted to follow towards studying science, technology and innovation policy. Thank you, Luc.

I would like to thank Prof. Dr. René Kemp. He is more than a promoter or a supervisor to me. I consider him as a critical father without false consciousness who on genuine grounds intellectually challenges his academically-or-else learning son. I am very pleased to have met him back in 2010. He is one of the few people towards whom I could have a full portfolio of feelings of respect ranging from a default civilised social respect to hard-to-earn intellectual respect. He has made thematic and applied contributions in changing the world. I would also like to thank him for assessing my efforts positively and providing me access to the initial and further research opportunities. Studying and working under supervision of Prof. Kemp is a gift. Thank you, René.

I would like to thank Prof. Dr. Bart Verspagen for providing me teaching opportunities at Maastricht University. It is a privilege to teach the "Science, Technology and Innovation (STI) Policy" course he coordinates within the

“Innovation, Institutions and Development” specialisation track of the Master’s programme, Public Policy and Human Development, at UNU-MERIT’s Graduate School of Governance (MGSoG). Teaching this course gave me a chance to share with students from all over the world. Working with a highly respected economist such as Prof. Verspagen in this course motivated me to do my utmost in teaching. I am extremely happy with the good evaluations that I was able to receive from the students and to have been requested to serve as a supervisor or a second reader by more than one third of the innovation cohort each year for the last three years. When I hear graduate students who are now working for international organisations such as Nicole Webley at UNESCO, Juul Pinxten at World Bank, Arjun Tasker at USAID and experiencing their choices to keep in touch with me, makes me feel that I am doing something right in a right way that would have been impossible without Bart Verspagen. Thank you, Bart. In the field of teaching, I would also like to thank to the Education Director of MGSoG, Dr. Lutz Krebs for his exceptional coordination skills, efforts and advices.

I would like to thank the scholars whom I had the chance to *meet*, such as *Bob Jessop*, *Jan Kooiman*, *Rob Hoppe*, *Phillip Cooke*, *Jan Rotmans*, *Frank Geels*, *Bengt-Åke Lundvall*, *Susana Borrás*, *Stefan Kuhlman* and *Jakob Edler*. I would like to thank the scholars from Turkey, such as Prof. Dr. Erkan Erdil, Prof. Dr. Teoman Pamukçu, Dr. Yılmaz Üstüner, and Dr. Barış Çakmur at the Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey, Science and Technology Policy Research Centre, METU-TEKPOL for providing me not only a competitive but also a cooperative intellectual background to communicate in the field of STI policy research.

I would like to thank the UNU-MERIT administrative personnel for their warm and concrete assistance, Susan Roggen, Janneke Knaapen, Anouk Mohammed-Dijkstra, Sueli Brodin and especially Wilma Coenegrachts and Eveline in de Braek. They are unique people with strong commitment. I would like to thank my friends for the memories that would fill quite some pages if written: Hampton, Güney, Oxana, Firat, Mahmut, Andrea, Richard, Omar, Corinne, Paula, Giacomo, Valery, Alison, Elisa and Ibrahima, and many more people whom I am happy to have met, and with whom I will stay in touch for the rest of my life.

I would like to thank Deborah Wythe, Head of Digital Collections and Services at Brooklyn Museum, New York, for allowing me to use on the cover page of this thesis the painting “Houses of Parliament, Sunlight Effect” by Claude Monet who, according to Bernard Denvir, a distinguished art critic, is the most prolific of the Impressionists and the painter who most obviously embodies their aesthetic vision.

*Serdar Türkeli,*  
Maastricht, December 22, 2015

# Contents

Acknowledgements.....	vi
List of Tables .....	xiii
Table of Figures.....	xv
<b>CHAPTER 1 - Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Background, relevance and primary theoretical conditions .....	1
1.2. Centrality and embeddedness of policy as the object of analysis and of design thinking.....	4
1.3. Multi-method research and analysis.....	6
1.3.1. Varieties of data types.....	6
1.3.2. Varieties of methods.....	7
1.3.2.1. Methodological limitations:.....	9
1.4. Internal logic of this thesis.....	9
1.5. Conceptualisation and operationalisation of political economy and analytical frameworks.....	11
1.5.1. Definitions of political economy .....	11
1.5.2. Political economy of technological change: A critical review .....	12
1.5.2.1. Production regimes .....	12
1.5.2.2. Systems of innovation .....	14
1.5.2.3. International, comparative political economy .....	17
1.5.2.4. Pushing forward on the political economy of technological change .....	19
1.6. Political economy as a system of ideas, interests and institutions .....	20
1.6.1. Interests, politics and policy .....	21
1.6.2. Ideas, politics and policy .....	21
1.6.3. Institutions, politics and policy dynamics.....	22
1.7. Analytical frameworks for each chapter.....	23
1.8. Research outline: Chapters of this thesis .....	30
Bibliography.....	38
<b>CHAPTER 2 - Effective Research and Innovation (R&amp;I) Policy in the EU-28: A causal and configurational analysis of political governance determinants.....</b>	<b>46</b>
2.1. Introduction.....	46



2.2. The political governance literature on R&I policy .....	48
2.2.1. The relevance of a governance policy: State and market interactions in R&I policy .....	50
2.2.2. Political systems and innovation systems: A co-evolution perspective .....	50
2.2.3. Learning for policy-makers: A heterarchical learning perspective .....	51
2.2.4. R&I policy, public legitimacy and accountability: Socio-technical and socio-political interactions .....	53
2.2.5. Proximate political governance determinants of R&I policy .....	55
2.3. Data, Hypotheses and Methods.....	57
2.3.1. Data.....	57
2.3.1.1. The dependent variable / the outcome indicator.....	58
2.3.1.2. Explanatory variables / the conditions / indicators .....	58
2.3.1.2.1. Inclusion of Sectorial Line Ministries (ISLM).....	58
2.3.1.2.2. Complementary Informal Inter-ministerial Coordination (CIIC) .....	59
2.3.1.2.3. Policy Communication (VHPC).....	59
2.3.2.2.4. RIA with Sustainability Checks (RIASC).....	60
2.3.2.2.5. Parliamentary Committees' Resources (PACR).....	60
2.3.2.2.6. Media Coverage of R&I Policy and Politics (MCRIPP).....	61
2.3.2.2.7. Societal Consultation (SPEC).....	62
2.3.2.1. Method I: Ordered Logit Econometric Estimations and Results .....	63
2.3.2.2. Method II: Fuzzy-Set Qualitative Comparative Analysis (fs/QCA) and Results .....	65
2.4. Discussions of the results.....	73
2.5. Concluding remarks and avenues of future research.....	75
Bibliography.....	76

**CHAPTER 3 - The Political Economy of Eco-innovation Governance in China and Europe: A Comparative Perspective..... 81**

3.1. Background: European and Chinese Ambitions to Promote Eco-innovation .....	81
3.1.1. Analytical Framework.....	83
3.2. Comparing Eco-innovation Policies in Terms of Thematic Issues .....	85
3.3. Identifying Barriers to Eco-innovation .....	86
3.3.1. China .....	86
3.3.1.2. Provincial Level – Jiangsu – Identifying Barriers to Eco-Innovation .....	90

3.3.2. The European Union .....	91
3.3.2.1. Member States – Germany – Identifying barriers to Eco-innovation.....	93
3.4. Mix of Eco-innovation Policies .....	94
3.4.1. China .....	94
3.4.1.2. Province of Jiangsu – Mix of Eco-innovation Policies.....	96
3.4.2 The European Union .....	96
3.2.1. Member States - Germany - Mix of Eco-Innovation Policies .....	98
3.5. Policy Coordination and Adjustments in China and Europe .....	100
3.5.1. China .....	100
3.5.1.2. Province of Jiangsu – Policy Coordination and Adjustments.....	101
3.5.2. The European Union .....	102
3.5.2.1. Member States - Germany - Policy Coordination and Adjustments.....	102
3.6. The Political Economy of Eco-innovation Governance in China and Europe: Evaluative concluding remarks.....	103
Bibliography.....	108

**CHAPTER 4 - The Political Economy of Research and Innovation in Organic Photovoltaics (OPV) in different world regions: *Northern America, Western Europe and East Asia*..... 115**

4.1. Introduction.....	116
4.2. Theoretical Background.....	118
4.3. Data, Measures and Methodology .....	122
4.4. Empirical Results .....	124
4.4.1. Company involvement/ Regional (Sub-national) Networking for OPV .....	124
4.4.2. Organisational Excellence, Policy and Programmes for OPV.....	127
4.4.3. International Cooperation .....	132
4.4.4. Commercialisation aspects .....	135
4.5. Evaluating the cognitive-institutional political economy element.....	142
4.6. Concluding Remarks.....	145
Bibliography.....	149

**CHAPTER 5 - Multiplicities of Innovation, Governance and Societal Challenges: *Social innovation cases from metropolitan areas in Europe* ..... 152**

5.1. Introduction.....	153
5.2. Theoretical background: Interactions between innovation, governance and societal challenges .....	155
5.2.1. Innovation.....	155
5.2.2. Governance.....	158
5.2.3 Societal Challenges.....	161
5.3. Empirical Background: Innovation, governance and societal challenges in metropolitan areas.....	162
5.3.1. Innovation: empirical challenges.....	162
5.3.2 Governance: empirical challenges.....	164
5.3.3. Societal challenges: metropolitan regions.....	167
5.3.4. Metropolitan policies to address societal challenges .....	171
5.4. Analysis: Integrated and interacting social innovation, metropolitan governance and initiatives for societal challenges .....	172
5.4.1. Case I – Birmingham .....	172
5.4.2. Case II – Stockholm .....	174
5.4.3. Case III – Berlin .....	175
5.4.4. Case IV – Stuttgart.....	177
5.4.5. Case V - Barcelona .....	178
5.4.6. Case VI – Manchester.....	180
5.4.7. Other social innovation policy models and examples of projects .....	180
5.4.7.1. Promoting social innovation and social entrepreneurship .....	181
5.4.7.2. Smart City Initiatives.....	183
5.4.7.3. Living Labs .....	185
5.4.7.4. Collective Awareness Platforms and Open Data.....	187
5.5. Discussions: Towards a societal system of innovation? .....	190
5.6. Concluding remarks and avenues for future research: towards a societal system of innovation?.....	197
5.6.1 Systems approach and a critique: Too rigid.....	197
5.6.2. Systems approach and another critique: Out-of-the-system actors, actions and relations .....	198
5.6.3. The lifeworld and a critique: Too abstract.....	200
5.6.3 The lifeworld and its external critique: Grassroots Initiatives.....	201

5.6.4 The case of social innovation.....	202
Bibliography.....	203
<b>CHAPTER 6 - Conclusions and Concluding Remarks.....</b>	<b>210</b>
Chapter 2 – Effective Research and Innovation (R&I) Policy in the EU: A Causal and Configurational Analysis of Political Governance Determinants .....	212
Methodological limitations of Chapter 2.....	214
Chapter 3 – The Political Economy of Eco-innovation Governance in China and Europe: A Comparative Perspective.....	215
Methodological limitations of Chapter 3.....	217
Chapter 4 – The Political Economy of Research and Innovation in Organic Photovoltaics (OPV) in Different World Regions .....	218
Methodological limitations of Chapter 4.....	219
Chapter 5 – Multiplicities of Innovation, Governance and Societal Challenges: Social Innovation Cases from Metropolitan Areas in Europe.....	220
Methodological limitations of Chapter 5.....	221
<b>Appendices .....</b>	<b>222</b>
Appendix 1.A – Interactions between the political and the economic: monist, dualist and dialectical approaches.....	222
Appendix 1.B - Summary of the construction of chapters .....	224
Appendix 2.A.1 - Qualitative Investigation .....	226
Appendix 2.A.2 - Quantitative Examination.....	232
Appendix 2.A.3 - Preliminary Discussions on Potential Implications of Proximate Political Governance on Member State and Supranational Interactive Dimensions .....	250
Appendix 3.A - Ten Themes of Eco-Innovation Policy in Europe .....	253
Appendix 4.A – OPV Global Survey – Information on Respondents.....	254
Appendix 4.B - Organic Photovoltaics (OPV) Global Survey .....	257
Appendix 5.A – Metropolitan Areas, Governance & Challenges & Technologies, Towards Societal System of Innovation Policy Instrument Design / Theory and Insights .....	271
<b>Addendum on valorisation.....</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>About the author.....</b>	<b>278</b>

## List of Tables

Table 1.1– Internal logic of the thesis .....	9
Table 1.2– Analytical frameworks and operationalisation of political economy: ideas, interests, and institutions / Chapter 2 .....	24
Table 1.3 – Analytical frameworks and operationalisation of political economy: ideas, interests, and institutions / Chapter 3 .....	26
Table 1.4– Analytical frameworks and operationalisation of political economy: ideas, interests, and institutions / Chapter 4 .....	27
Table 1.5– Analytical frameworks and operationalisation of political economy: ideas, interests, and institutions / Chapter 5 .....	29
Table 1.6 - Overview of empirical governance studies in the thesis .....	37
Table 2.1 – Mapping the theoretical backgrounds of indicator selection .....	56
Table 2.2 – Descriptive Statistics .....	63
Table 2.3 – Ordered-Logit Estimation Results .....	64
Table 2.4 – Calibration: the Outcome, Five Conditions, Fuzzy Values.....	67
Table 2.5 – Analysis of Necessary Conditions – Presence of the outcome (Effective R&I Policy).....	68
Table 2.6 – Analysis of Necessary Conditions – Absence of the outcome (Ineffective R&I Policy).....	68
Table 2.7 – Sufficient combinations of conditions for effective R&I Policy .....	70
Table 2.8 – Sufficient combinations of conditions for ineffective R&I Policy .....	71
Table 4.1 - Systems of Innovation Frameworks .....	121
Table 4.2- Characteristics of Varieties of Capitalism.....	122
Table 4.3– Barriers to Commercialisation .....	136
Table 4.4– Does your own Research have commercial value?.....	136
Table 5.1 – Summary and mapping of empirical cases analysed in this chapter .....	189
Table 5.2 –Interactions between three systems of Innovation in Metropolitan Areas.....	192
Table 1.A – Interactions between the political and the economic: monist, dualist and dialectical approaches .....	222
Table 1.B - Summary of the construction of chapters .....	224
Table 2.A.1.1 - A review of “Political Governance” articles.....	226
Table 2.A.1.2 - Showcases for theoretically-informed selected indicators .....	229
Table 2.A.2.1 –Proximate political governance models and data.....	232
Table 2.A.2.2 – Correlation Table (Proximate and Distal Indicators).....	233

Table 2.A.2.3.1 - Descriptive Statistics – Dependent Variable.....	235
Table 2.A.2.3.2 - Skewness/Kurtosis tests for Normality:.....	235
Table 2.A.2.3.3 - Correlations (Spearman for ordinal variables).....	236
Table 2.A.2.3.4 - Collinearity Diagnostics for system of variables .....	236
Table 2.A.2.3.5 - Measures of fit (ordered logit).....	237
Table 2.A.2.3.6 - Odds Ratios .....	237
Table 2.A.2.3.7 - Odds Ratios (log Media) .....	238
Table 2.A.2.3.8 - Marginal effects of each independent variable .....	239
Table 2.A.2.3.9 - Marginal effects of each independent variable (log Media).....	240
Table 2.A.2.3.10 - Media Coverage in Research & Innovation Policy and Politics / Lexis Nexis 1 May 2011- 15 May 2013.....	241
Table 2.A.2.3.11 - Regression Results: Proximate political governance, three sub-models...	243
Table 2.A.2.3.12.a - Index Formation with PCA and Equal Weights/Formal Coordination .	244
Table 2.A.2.3.12.b – Index Formation with PCA and Equal Weights/Informal Coordination .....	245
Table 2.A.2.3.12.c – Index Formation with PCA and Equal Weights/Communicative Coordination .....	246
Table 2.A.2.3.13 – Correlations of our Indices with WGI indicators.....	247
Table 2.A.2.3.14 – Picking the Distal (action-oriented) Variables.....	247
Table 2.A.2.3.15 – Regression results with Sub-Models (with different index creation methods, and broader/distal institutional conditions) .....	248
Table 4.A.1 - Roles in Research: Presence of Multiple Roles.....	255
Table 4.A.2 - Inter-Organisational Occupations in Research in Major World Regions .....	255
Table 4.A.3 – Respondents’ Local/Regional Breakdown.....	256
Table 5.A.1 - Metropolitan areas.....	271
Table 5.A.2 – Technology Research Area Distribution in Governance-related Scientific Publications, 2012 .....	272
Table 5.A.3 – Towards a Societal System of Innovation and Theoretical Combinations .....	273
Table 5.A.4 – Towards a Societal System of Innovation and its Generalised Framework towards Policy Instrument Design – Insights.....	274

## Table of Figures

Figure 1.1 – Existing conceptions of modes of governance in politics, polity and policy dimensions.....	5
Figure 2.1– Solution Plot – Presence of Effective R&I Policy .....	72
Figure 2.2– Solution Plot – Absence of Effective R&I Policy.....	73
Figure 3.2 – Annual Solar PV Production in Selected Countries, 1995-2010.....	89
Figure 3.3 – Barriers to accelerated eco-innovation and uptake development.....	92
Figure 3.4 – Solar PV Cumulative Annual Capacity by region MW 2001-2012.....	92
Figure 3.5 - Revenues generated by major solar PV companies by Region, US\$ m, 2009.....	93
Figure 3.6 – FP7 (first 4 years) and FP6 Investment in Solar PV.....	97
Figure 3.7 - Multi-level structure of financing instruments .....	98
Figure 3.8 – Breakdown of approved solar PV funding in Germany .....	99
Figure 3.9 - PV Support Measures in China in 2009.....	101
Figure 4.1– Regional Network involving companies (Left) and Degree of Company Involvement (Right) .....	124
Figure 4.2– Degree of Company Involvement in Major World Regions .....	124
Figure 4.3 – What role do industrial needs play in OPV research? (%).....	125
Figure 4.4– Degree of Local Authorities Involvement in Partnerships and Breakdown (%).....	125
Figure 4.5– Involvement of Researchers in Policy Discussions (%) .....	126
Figure 4.6 – Conflicts of Interest, National Platform and Regional breakdown (%).....	126
Figure 4.7- Excellence with respect to Field and Type of Research.....	127
Figure 4.8– Policy Support Spreading over too many technologies (%) .....	128
Figure 4.9 – Portfolio Broadness of OPV Research (%).....	128
Figure 4.10– Level of Public Funding (%).....	129
Figure 4.11– Funding Levels in the last 5 years (%).....	129
Figure 4.12 – OPV Research Agenda too much determined by short term industrial needs.....	130
Figure 4.13- OPV Research Agenda too much determined by Science .....	130
Figure 4.14- OPV Research Agenda too much determined by political/government missions .....	131
Figure 4.15 – Partly supported through a national programme (Left); benefitting from a regional (sub-national) programme (Right) .....	132
Figure 4.16 – Level of International Cooperation .....	132
Figure 4.17– Most valuable aspects of EU projects.....	133

Figure 4.18 - Cooperation inside Europe (Left); Cooperation outside Europe (Right).....	133
Figure 4.19– Policy Coordination between regional and national level.....	134
Figure 4.20– Answers to statement that “policy support is too fragmented” .....	134
Figure 4.21– How important is commercialisation of OPV in Support programmes.....	135
Figure 4.22- Obtained Patent (%) (Left); Regional Breakdown (%) (Right).....	137
Figure 4.23- Licensing Research Findings (%) (Left); Regional Breakdown (%) (Right) .....	137
Figure 4.24- Discoveries not patented (%) (Left); Regional Breakdown (%) (Right).....	138
Figure 4.25- Reasons for not patenting (%) (Left); Regional Breakdown (%) (Right) .....	138
Figure 4.26– OPV Research Spin-offs (%).....	139
Figure 4.27– Likely to be most successful country in commercialisation of OPV inventions .....	139
Figure 4.28 – Success factors for Commercialisation .....	140
Figure 4.29- Possibilities for commercialisation Europe (Left); China (Right) .....	140
Figure 4.30- Which markets are targeted for OPV Applications? .....	141
Figure 4.31– Expectation on the First Market Applications (%) .....	141
Figure 4.32 – System Scores of Knowledge Creation and Knowledge Dissemination .....	142
Figure 5.1 - Average characteristics of the Regions (NUTS) of the 29 largest Metropolitan Areas in Europe, EU27=100 .....	157
Figure 5.2 - 1988 – 1990 Constituent Research Sub-areas of Governance Research .....	158
Figure 5.3 - 2010 – 2012 Constituent Research Sub-areas of Governance Research .....	159
Figure 5.4 - Multi-dimensional Prerequisites: Societal Challenges, Governance and Innovation.....	162
Figure 5.5 - Average characteristics of the Regions (NUTS) of the 29 largest Metropolitan Areas in Europe, EU27=100 .....	164
Figure 5.6 - Quality of government in London compared to UK and other regions .....	167
Figure 5.7 – Towards a Societal System of Innovation?.....	192
Figure 5.8 – Interactions of Regional and Sectoral Systems in Smart Specialisation .....	194
Figure 5.9 – Interactions of Sectoral and Technological Systems in Industrial Strategies.....	195
Figure 5.10– Interactions of policy networks for policy decisions in Governance.....	196
Figure 2.A.3.1 – Play of proximate political governance at Member State level .....	250
Figure 2.A.3.2 – An International Architecture for Proximate Political Governance for effective R&I Policy .....	252
Figure 4.A.1- % in Publications in OPV vs. % in Responses in OPV Survey .....	254